

TO: eCityGov Alliance Executive Board
FROM: Marilynne Beard, Interim Executive Director
DATE: June 8, 2018
SUBJECT: JUNE 15, 2018 EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING

The next Executive Board meeting will be held on Friday, June 15 at 10:00 am at Kirkland City Hall, Peter Kirk Room. Following are a few updates and introductory comments to the proposed agenda items.

Executive Director Recruitment Update

At the April 20 Executive Board meeting the Board approved the final job description for the Executive Director and the recruitment strategy. The recruitment strategy involved initial outreach to potential candidates and to Alliance members that may know potential candidates. A number of colleagues were contacted and they did provide contacts. They are in the process of contacting the potential candidates to describe the position. Once they have made contact, I can be available to answer any further questions. In the meantime, a job announcement was drafted (see attached) and we are initiating the job posting process through Bellevue's Human Resources Department. The plan is to post the position "until filled" with an applicant review after thirty days.

After initial screening, the interview process should include Executive Board members, Bellevue Service Delivery Team Members and representatives from Alliance committees (e.g. Management Committee). At the June 15 meeting, the Board can determine who is interested in participating in the interviews. The final hiring decision will be made by the Executive Board.

2019-2020 Budget Discussion

Background on the 2019-2020 Budget was provided at the last Board meeting and a copy is attached for your reference in the agenda packet. At the April meeting, the Board provided preliminary direction regarding the budget including:

- Continue the base budget for expenditures, including the Executive Director at full time at top step.
- Redistribute Alliance costs to recognize the relative amount of staff resources devoted to each product. Other than costs specifically related to a product, costs were reallocated at 90% to MyBuildingPermit, 7.5% to GovJobsToday and 2.5% to NW Property (the 2018 Budget is allocated at 75% to MPB and 12.5% each to GJT and NWP).
- Apply King County subscriber fees to the base budget to offset all other fees.
- Smooth rates between 2019 and 2020.

- Bring back options for GovJobsToday fees to including consideration of changing from a population based distribution to an FTE based distribution and fee offsets for jurisdictions that don't use all of the functionality of the program (e.g. portal only).

The expenditure side of the budget is mostly unchanged from what was presented at the April Board meeting. Small adjustments were made to recognize updated expenditure information. The revenue side of the budget is calculated to cover the expense side and distributed to principals and subscriber fees per the adopted distribution methodology contained in the Financial Policies.

Two changes from the April presentation include smoothing rates between 2019 and 2020 and the distribution methodology for GovJobsToday fees.

The smoothing of rates allows a more consistent fee structure over the two years. The total amount collected is unchanged but the effect of smoothing brings slightly more income the first year and slightly less the second year.

Based on direction provided by the Board, the 2019-2020 Budgeted expenditure and resulting rates will be used to notify principals and subscribers of proposed rates for the coming biennium (provided no later than September 15). If further board discussion is needed, an additional Executive Board meeting can be scheduled prior to September 15.

Subscribers and principals that are changing their status (from principal to subscriber) or unsubscribing to a product must notify the Alliance by early October. At that point, based on known principals and subscribers, a final budget can be developed. Principal rates must be adopted by each of the principals in their annual or biennial budget for the Alliance budget to be finalized (prior to December 31).

Options for GovJobsToday fees is discussed under separate cover (see GovJobsToday Options memo in the agenda packet).



JOB ANNOUNCEMENT

eCityGov Alliance

Executive Director

The eCityGov Alliance is seeking an experienced professional to serve as its Executive Director.

About the Alliance

The eCityGov Alliance was formed in 2001 by a group of cities located in the Puget Sound region of Washington State. The cities came together to form a public non-profit agency with a mission of providing online services to residents and businesses. The Alliance is composed of six partner agencies that have an owner interest and sixteen subscriber agencies that purchase access to Alliance products. All partners and subscribers have full consensus-based participation on project committees.

The eCityGov Alliance has developed a unique business model by creating portals that are branded by service area and deployed as cross-jurisdictional web services. The portals have been a resounding success and have demonstrated the benefits to agencies and citizens of regional collaboration. The service-specific portals include:

- MyBuildingPermit.com
- NWProperty.net
- GovJobsToday.com

The eCityGov Alliance was created to think, grow and experiment with business solutions that would replace city-centric web services with seamless, cross-boundary web services. The Alliance and member cities' goal is to provide constituents with easy-to-find, consistent services, regardless of which city is responsible for providing the service.

The eCityGov Alliance has not only been successful for municipalities and counties in Washington State, but it also serves as a model to other regions for cross-boundary collaboration and web-based services. In doing so, the Alliance model provides constituents with convenient, user-friendly services in a way that is cost effective for each jurisdiction. In other words, the Alliance uses technology to drive good government.

The Position

The Executive Director serves on behalf of the eCityGov Alliance Executive Board, reporting to the Executive Board. The City of Bellevue hosts the eCityGov Alliance on behalf of the partner agencies, providing facilities, equipment, technology and administrative support. The Executive Director is an employee of the City of Bellevue.

The Executive Director ensures that Alliance programs continue to support the values and mission of the Alliance and continually improve functionality to ensure a consistent and beneficial customer experience. This includes developing and managing to the Alliance business plan in accordance with the direction of the Executive Board. Other responsibilities include:

- Supports the Executive Board in the management and strategic planning for the eCityGov Alliance and manages all business processes in compliance with the e CityGov Alliance Interlocal Agreement, Executive Board Bylaws and adopted policies.
- Develops and implements business plans for all projects authorized by the Executive Board. Regularly assesses all eCityGov Alliance lines of business and continuously pursues program improvements.
- Develops and monitors budgets throughout the year and assures that programs and projects operate within approved budgets.
- Supports and assists Alliance partners and subscribers with resolving business and technical issues.
- Manages vendor relationships including the City of Bellevue Service Level Agreement which provides for information technology and administrative support for the Alliance.
- Maintains and enhances the positive reputation of the eCityGov Alliance in the community and with existing and potential customers.
- Ensures excellent communication through all levels of the organization which includes the Executive Board, partner and subscriber agencies, staff and customers.
- Actively markets Alliance products to make the programs available to a range of municipalities, counties and special districts.

Skills and Abilities

- Strong program management skills including knowledge of project management principles and the ability to coordinate the work of others within deadlines.
- Ability to analyze complex technical, legal, policy or political issues and develop creative, cost-effective, feasible alternatives.
- Ability to develop and present budget proposals and create project plans that can operate within budget authority.
- Ability to monitor work in progress, identify business and/or technical issues and develop coordinated action plans to ensure project success.
- Demonstrated skill in resolving conflicts and gaining cooperation among competing interest groups.
- Extensive knowledge of local political and governmental processes, functions, authorities, responsibilities, and issues related to governmental business systems and

related information technology. Understanding of the regional political environment and sensitivities; ability to function effectively within that environment and to establish positive interpersonal relations with political and government officials.

- Ability to communicate clearly, tactfully, and persuasively, orally and in writing, to individuals and groups.
- Ability to coordinate, participate on, and develop effective teams in a collaborative manner.
- Knowledge of information technology systems and project management, development, support, and related terminology.
- Ability to administer contracts with outside vendors and service providers.
- Experience managing complex interagency relationships; ability to work in an environment with indirect or ambiguous reporting relationships.
- Ability to adapt to changing environments and dynamics while inspiring confidence and good business sense.

Budget

The Alliance operates under a two-year (biennial) budget cycle. The 2018 portion of the 2017-2018 budget is \$1.35 million. Alliance expenses are supported by annual fees paid by partners and subscribers. The largest portion of the Alliance expenditure budget supports technology services provided through a Service Level Agreement with the City of Bellevue. The Alliance Service Delivery Team provides user support, project management and software development services to support Alliance products.

Qualifications

- Master's degree in business administration, public administration, information technology or related field. Bachelor's degree with equivalent relevant experience will be considered.
- Minimum 3-5 years' experience managing programs and budgets.
- Demonstrated experience in managing complex projects and information technology initiatives.

Compensation and Benefits

The Executive Director is a City of Bellevue employee located at Bellevue City Hall.

- Salary Range: \$104,932 - \$144,104
- Medical, Dental and Vision
- Life Insurance
- Long term disability
- Employee Assistance Program
- Flexible Spending Account
- 12 paid holidays
- Vacation time
- Sick Leave
- Retirement Benefits

To Apply

Interested candidates will submit a City of Bellevue application during the open posting period.

Agenda Executive Board Meeting

Friday, June 15, 2018 • 10:00-12:00pm

*Kirkland City Hall, Peter Kirk Room
Audio - Please call 1-877-848-7030 and then Access Code 8765293.*

Consent Items

Approval of April 20, 2018 Executive Board Meeting Minutes (attached)

Strategic Issues, Planning and/or Action Items

- Information: Update from Interim Executive Director
 - Executive Director Recruitment Update
- Discussion and Direction: 2019-2020 Biennial Budget
 - Summary of Updated Base Budget
 - GovJobsToday Options
 - i. Principal and Subscriber Fee Options
 - ii. Options for the Future of GovJobsToday as an Alliance product
- Adjourn

Minutes Executive Board Meeting

*Friday, April 20th, 2018 • 10:00am - 12:00pm
Peter Kirk Room, Kirkland City Hall*

Call in only: Audio - 1-877-848-7030 and then Access Code 8765293.

Strategic Issues, Planning and/or Action Items

Executive Board Attendees: Tracey Dunlap, Kirkland; Nathan McCommon, Bellevue; John Traeger, Issaquah; Aaron Antin, Sammamish

Subscriber Board Attendees: Barbara Mock, Snohomish County

Other:

Marilynne Beard, eCityGov Interim Executive Director; Warren Cheney, King County; Michele Miller, eCityGov; M'Lisa Marks, Secretary

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Tracey Dunlap at 10:05am.

Consent Items

Motion to approve consent calendar by Aaron Antin, seconded by Nathan McCommon and the motion carried unanimously.

Strategic Issues, Planning and/or Action Items

Update from Interim Executive Director

ILA Ratification Update – all ILAs have been approved and signed. Hard copies have been made for each jurisdiction.

Marilynne Beard described recent Subscriber Changes

City of Lake Stevens has withdrawn from GovJobsToday as of Jan 1, 2018

City of Issaquah has withdrawn from GovJobsToday as of Jan 1, 2019

City of Lake Forest Park and Northshore Utility District

SeaTac is withdrawing from Northwest Properties January 1, 2019.

SeaTac is joining MyBuildingPermit 2018

Woodinville is withdrawing from MyBuildingPermit January 1, 2019 and implementing Accela. Discussion followed regarding what the eCityGov Executive Board can do to facilitate the “passing of the baton” when an employee, who has been active with eCityGov, leaves a jurisdiction.

GovJobToday Options

Marilynne shared that at least two new jurisdictions have expressed interest in subscribing to GovJobsToday, understanding that GJT support may not be available after 2021. The executive Board agreed to allow new subscribers to join GovJobsToday. Discussion ensued regarding adding verbiage to the Subscriber Agreement addressing GovJobsToday no support beyond 2021.

Preliminary estimate for Bellevue Development Team to port GJT to a new platform was received and Marilynne Beard asked for additional detail. Marilynne Beard also met with Crelate, a Kirkland-based software company, to discuss a possible partnership with a revenue sharing arrangement. NeoGov offered a discounted 1-year introductory price to our jurisdictions. There is no savings for jurisdictions that are currently using NeoGov. Discussion about the future of GovJobsToday will continue at a future Board meeting.

Board Action: Discuss and Vote on Rotation of Board Officers

Marilynne presented Resolution 2018-04 Setting and confirming the board Rotation for the Officer Positions. Chair: Aaron Antin, Vice Chair: PJ Rodriguez, Treasurer: Tracey Dunlap

Nathan McCommon made a motion to accept Resolution 2018-04 as presented. Aaron Antin seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously. Board rotations are effective May 1, 2018.

Board Action: Discuss and Vote on Authorization for Executive Director to Execute a New Subscriber Agreement and Proposed Change in Subscriber Agreement for the City of SeaTac.

Marilynne Beard provided an overview of the recommended changes to new subscriber agreements that changes subscribers from non-voting committee members to voting members. Staff committees generally operate on a consensus basis and all members vote. Barb Mock added historical insight from a subscriber's point of view.

There was agreement that all subscriber agreements need to be consistent. Warren Cheney cautioned that the verbiage needs to be clear. Tracey Dunlap suggested a subscriber agreement subcommittee review the agreements. Marilynne Beard will review the subscriber agreements to identify discrepancies.

Aaron Antin made a motion to approve Resolution 2018-05 authorizing the Executive Director to execute the non-voting subscriber agreement with SeaTac. John Traeger seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Discussion: Executive Director Job Description Update and Recruitment Process

The Board agreed to search locally for candidates with experience with eCityGov before launching a wider recruitment. The MBP Management Committee strongly advises to keep the current title. It was decided to keep the title of Executive Director.

Salary is currently tied to a City of Bellevue Assistant Director position; minimum \$104,391, maximum \$144,103. Nathan commented that this position requires a high-quality candidate with a high level of sophistication. The existing salary range will remain in place for recruiting and budgeting purposes.

The board agreed to move forward with the strategy presented.

Discussion: 2019-2020 Biennial Budget

Marilynne Beard reviewed the timeline for budget development and adoption. The eCityGov Alliance by-laws require that the budget be proposed to the board by June 30th. The Executive Board will approve the biennial budget by August 31st. Subscribers not continuing with a product must notify the Alliance 90 days prior to December 31st (October 2nd). Final fees and budget is developed and adopted by December 31st.

The Alliance has been notified that the State Auditor's Office will complete the 2016 and 2017 audits in 2018, moving to a biennial audit cycle. Bellevue IT staff will obtain a quote from the auditors for 2018 and 2020.

The Board discussed GovJobsToday fees for those jurisdictions that are primarily using NeoGov but use the GovJobsToday portal to post job openings. Bellevue currently operates in that manner and Issaquah is implementing NeoGov and may or may not use GovJobsToday portal in the future. Tracey Dunlap indicated that Kirkland will also be moving to a different back-end application system in the future.

One option is to reduce the cost of GovJobsToday for those using NeoGov by some factor such as a population offset. The result is a higher rate for other partners. Another option is to change the fee to be FTE-based rather than population with a percentage discount or combination of both. Marilynne Beard will research the numbers for each option and report back at the next meeting to the Executive Board.

The Board discussed the date for the next meeting which is scheduled for June 15th. A poll will be sent to see who is available for the meeting on June 15th.

Dates to remember:

June 7, 2018 is the MBP Annual Business meeting. A save the date email was sent Friday, April 20th, 2018.

Adjournment

Motion to adjourn was made by Nathan McCommon, 2nd by Aaron Antin. The meeting adjourned at 12:05 PM.

**BUDGET MEMO FROM APRIL 20
EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING**

TO: eCityGov Alliance Executive Board

FROM: Marilynne Beard, Interim Executive Director

DATE: April 13, 2018

SUBJECT: 2019-2020 BUDGET

A preliminary base 2019 budget has been prepared and staff is seeking Board feedback and direction on several policy issues. The Alliance budget process timeline is contained in the Interlocal Agreement Section 12.a.

- a. *Budget Approval. The Executive Director shall develop the proposed operating budget. The Executive Director and Executive Board shall use best efforts to meet the scheduled budget dates set forth in this Section but failure to meet such dates shall not constitute a breach of this Agreement.*
 - i. *The Executive Director shall present a proposed budget to the Executive Board by no later than **June 30** prior to the commencement of the budget period, together with any Program Committee recommendations with respect to the proposed budget.*
 - ii. *By no later than **August 31**, the Executive Board shall (1) review and revise the draft budget as it deems appropriate; (2) approve the draft budget (including proposed charges to Participants and any user fees); and (3) forward the same to Principals. The approved draft budget, and all proposed fees and charges shall be forwarded to Subscribers no later than **September 15**.*
 - iii. *The final budget shall be adopted by vote of the Executive Board effective no later than **December 31** prior to commencement of the budget period, after receiving information as to:*
 1. *which Subscribers will be continuing to contract with the Alliance;*
and
 2. *which Principals have or will approve their shares of the Alliance budget, based on action or information from such Principals received by the Alliance no later than **December 1**.*
 - iv. *Vote Required to Approve Budget. A Simple Majority Vote of the Executive Board is required to approve the draft and final budget.*

The next Executive Board meeting is scheduled for June 15. An updated budget will be presented for preliminary approval at that meeting.

Base Budget Overview

The base budget reflects no change in service levels but does acknowledge inflationary changes, changes in subscriber memberships and a recommended shift from unrestricted programs to restricted programs to more accurately reflect actual costs and hours. Base budget assumptions include:

Expenditures Assumptions

- Continues full time Executive Director at 2018 salary plus an adjustment for known cost of living and benefit costs. There is a cost of living adjustment of 2.45% assumed for the Executive Director position in the 2019 Budget and 2.41% in the 2020 base budget. Benefits are inflated by 2.5% each year. The same assumptions were used to calculate the Bellevue SLA employee costs.
- Increases Bellevue Service Level Agreement hours to reflect Service Delivery Manager (increase from 2.18 FTE to 2.25 FTE).
- All programs continue in 2019-2020 including MyBuildingPermit (MBP), GovJobsToday (GJT) and NWProperty (NWP).
- There is no proposed use of reserves in base budget.
- Program Cost Shifting - Aside from costs strictly associated with a program, all other Alliance expenses have been distributed at a rate of 75% to MyBuildingPermit and 25%, split evenly, to GovJobsToday and NWProperty (i.e. 12.5% to each). Actual hours for the Service Delivery Team developers and business analysts are almost entirely devoted to MBP as is most of the Executive Director's time. The base budget recommends reallocating costs from the unrestricted programs to MBP to acknowledge the relative level of effort dedicated to each program. The base budget changes the relative allocation to 90% MBP, 7.5% GJT and 2.5% NWP. This change results in a shift to MBP fees over the 2018 budget and a reduction in partner fees for GJT and NWP (GJT and NWP subscriber fees are flat rate based on ranges of population). Even with the shift from unrestricted to restricted (MBP), overall MBP rates are generally less than 2018 due to the application of King County subscriber fees.

Revenue Assumptions

- Revenue from fees is based on formulas provided in the Alliance financial policies – total expenditures less subscriber fees equals partner fees which are distributed to partners proportionally based on development fees (MBP) or population (GJT and NWP). The base budget assumes King County subscriber fees are redistributed to all other MBP

members resulting in an offset to 2018 MBP fees.

- Woodinville withdraws from MBP, Lake Stevens withdraws from GovJobsToday and SeaTac withdraws from NWProperty. No new subscriber fees are assumed in the base until a subscriber agreement is executed.
- A small inflationary increase is incorporated into flat fee subscriber rates for GJT and NWP.

There is further refinement needed to the budget workbook. For instance, final permit revenue to calculate the 5-year average for one jurisdiction needs to be verified in addition to closer scrutiny of line items. A summary of the change in partner and subscriber fees that results from the base budget assumptions is attached to this memo (Attachments A).

The net effect of the policy changes recommended in the base budget, subscriber changes and the application of an updated 5-year average for permit fees (2011-2015 used in 2018 versus 2013-2017 for 2019) produces varied results by jurisdiction.

After applying the King County subscriber fees and the cost shift from unrestricted to restricted, most MBP partners see a decrease in MBP fees except those jurisdictions whose 5-year average permit fees increased disproportionately compared to other jurisdictions. Please note these estimates may shift when all figures have been finalized.

	5-Year Avg 2011-2015	5-Year Avg 2013-2017	% Change
Bellevue	13,125,597	19,072,189	45.3%
Issaquah	2,694,355	3,852,753	43.0%
Kenmore	740,508	895,521	20.9%
Kirkland	5,837,289	9,349,586	60.2%
Sammamish	2,858,521	3,318,951	16.1%
Snoqualmie	696,523	1,144,294	64.3%

The cost shift from unrestricted to restricted reduces all partner fees for GJT and NWP. The total reduction in partner fees is 10% - largely the result of applying the King County subscriber fees.

Additional analysis will be provided at the Executive Board meeting on April 20.

Policy Issues

Policy issues for discussion and possible direction from the Executive Board are described below.

GovJobsToday Fee Adjustment for Partners

The City of Bellevue has implemented NEOGOV for applicant management. Bellevue still posts jobs on GovJobsToday as well as on NEOGOV's portal "Government Jobs." Since costs are allocated by population for GJT, Bellevue has the largest GJT fee of all partners.

In 2017, the Executive Board adopted an updated Interlocal Agreement that eliminated the requirement that partners use all of the Alliance products:

"6.f. Requirement of Principals Use of Alliance Programs and Services. No Principal is required to use or deploy all Programs and Services offered by the Alliance. Nothing in this Agreement shall be interpreted to preclude a Participant from using or deploying competing services or programs similar in functionality to Programs and Services offered by the Alliance."

There is also a general statement in the ILA that fees could be adjusted:

Cost Allocation. The costs of funding the approved Alliance budget, net of all estimated revenue chargeable to Subscribers and all other revenues, shall be generally allocated between all Principals based on their relative Population. The Board can establish other cost allocation methods by Supermajority Vote that are considered equitable to all other Principals and appropriate for the applicable Programs and Services. Nothing in this Agreement shall be construed to prohibit the Executive Board from including factors in addition to Principal Population or making other equitable adjustments in the cost allocation formulas, including but not limited to adjustments for Principals who do not use or deploy certain Programs and Services offered by the Alliance pursuant to Section 6.g.

Based on a request from Bellevue, in 2017 Tracy Jones began discussions with Bellevue about the potential for a reduced rate to acknowledge their limited use of GJT. Those discussions were not completed prior to Tracy's departure from the Alliance and the Executive Board was not presented with a recommendation.

Since that time, the Alliance has been contacted by the City of Issaquah advising that they are also implementing NEOGOV and anticipate moving off of GovJobsToday entirely by September 2018.

Some annual fee is reasonable for partial use of the product and for the benefit of maintaining an ownership interest in the intellectual property. In addition, it is important to keep in mind the impact on other partners' fees.

There are multiple approaches that could be considered for adjusting partner fees. A change to the formula for calculating population-based fees could be implemented by assigning a

percentage reduction to population based on limited use. For example, Bellevue's and Issaquah's populations could be reduced by an established percentage to reduce their fee. Attachment C summarizes the relative change in partner fees if Issaquah and Bellevue populations are discounted to 25% of the actual population (this would result in a fee reduction in addition to the program cost shifting noted above). The effect is to redistribute GJT costs to other partners and reduce Bellevue and Issaquah GJT fees to 25% of what their partners fees would otherwise be. A summary of the change in fees following this scenario is attached to this memo (Attachment B).

A different approach would be a reduction to a flat fee that is an amount of program costs that represents the value of the partner's ownership interest. That amount would then be prorated based on population.

It is recommended that a formulaic approach be used so that future changes in program usage can be easily incorporated in the rate model.

Overall Distribution of Costs Between Subscribers and Partners

A topic for future discussion is the manner in which fees are calculated. The formula for distributing costs between partners and subscribers has changed over the years, but the underlying principle of partners paying all costs not covered by subscriber fees has been in place for some time. The evolution of subscribers joining and withdrawing and partners changing to subscribers has resulted in an ever-larger burden on partner agencies. Although, this trend changes in 2019 with the offset to all MBP users by the addition of King County fees, leadership changes within partner agencies may result in greater scrutiny or questioning of the original guiding principles that supported and sustained the Alliance.

In order to maintain active partners, the Board may want to consider a different way to distribute the financial benefit of adding new subscribers. For example, the financial benefit of new subscribers could be distributed between partners and subscribers with a proportionately larger share of the benefit accruing to partners and the remaining benefit distributed to subscribers.

Summary

One of the projects identified for the Executive Director was a simplification of the budget development process and tools. The Bellevue Finance support staff have made many of the requested changes to the budget workbook to remove extraneous data, simplify use, provide "what-if" capabilities and improve the presentation. Some of these changes are a work in progress. The hope is that the budget process and tools will be more accessible and useful for Alliance staff in the future.

eCityGov Alliance Fees

	2018				2019/2020				Change				
	MBP	NWProp	GovJobs	Total	MBP	NWProp	GovJobs	Total	MBP	NWProp	GovJobs	Total	
Partner Member													
Belleuve	297,658	27,831	24,618	350,107	302,560	4,564	19,279	326,403	4,902	(23,267)	(5,339)	(23,704)	-6.8%
Issaquah	61,102	6,871	6,078	74,051	61,120	1,169	4,937	67,225	18	(5,702)	(1,141)	(6,825)	-9.2%
Kenmore	16,793	4,432	3,921	25,146	14,206	732	3,094	18,033	(2,587)	(3,700)	(827)	(7,113)	-28.3%
Kirkland	132,376	17,206	15,220	164,802	148,321	2,792	11,795	162,908	15,945	(14,414)	(3,425)	(1,894)	-1.1%
Sammamish	64,825	10,304	9,114	84,243	52,652	2,019	8,528	63,199	(12,173)	(8,285)	(586)	(21,044)	-25.0%
Snoqualmie	15,795	2,648	2,343	20,786	18,153	428	1,810	20,392	2,358	(2,220)	(533)	(395)	-1.9%
Total Partner Fees	588,548	69,292	61,294	719,134	597,012	11,704	49,443	658,159	8,464	(57,588)	(11,851)	(60,975)	-8.5%
Subscriber Member													
Bothell all (S)	58,201	3,600		61,801	49,962	3,700	-	53,662	(8,239)	100	-	(4,539)	-13.2%
Burien	24,973			24,973	23,219	-	-	23,219	(1,754)	-	-	(1,754)	-7.0%
Des Moines		3,600		3,600	-	3,700	-	3,700	-	100	-	3,700	2.8%
Dupont		-	1,600	1,600	-	-	1,600	1,600	-	-	-	1,600	0.0%
Everett		7,700		7,700	-	7,900	-	7,900	-	200	-	7,900	2.6%
Gig Harbor			1,600	1,600	-	-	1,600	1,600	-	-	-	1,600	0.0%
King County	251,837			251,837	203,398	-	-	203,398	(48,439)	-	-	(48,439)	-19.2%
Mercer Island (S)	40,081		3,600	43,681	38,153	-	3,700	41,853	(1,928)	-	100	1,772	-4.2%
Mill Creek	8,373			8,373	8,725	-	-	8,725	353	-	-	353	4.2%
Newcastle	13,427		2,600	16,027	17,815	-	2,700	20,515	4,388	-	100	7,088	28.0%
NORCOM			5,100	5,100	-	-	5,200	5,200	-	-	100	5,200	2.0%
North Bend		800		800	-	800	-	800	-	-	-	800	0.0%
Renton (S)	99,103			99,103	92,432	-	-	92,432	(6,671)	-	-	(6,671)	-6.7%
SeaTac		3,600		3,600	-	3,700	-	3,700	-	100	-	3,700	2.8%
Snohomish Unincorporated	247,352			247,352	218,525	-	-	218,525	(28,827)	-	-	(28,827)	-11.7%
Tukwila		2,500		2,500	-	-	-	-	-	(2,500)	-	-	-100.0%
Woodinville (S)	14,831		2,600	17,431	-	-	2,700	2,700	(14,831)	-	100	(12,131)	-84.5%
Total Subscriber Fees	758,177	21,800	17,100	797,077	652,230	19,800	17,500	689,530	(105,948)	(2,000)	400	(107,548)	-13.5%
Total Fees	1,346,726	91,092	78,394	1,516,212	1,249,242	31,504	66,943	1,347,689	(97,484)	(59,588)	(11,451)	(168,523)	-11.1%

TO: eCityGov Alliance Executive Board
FROM: Marilynne Beard, Interim Executive Director
DATE: June 1, 2018
SUBJECT: GOVJOBSTODAY OPTIONS

The purpose of this memo is to provide background and discussion of options for the future of GovJobsToday (GJT). Two policy issues will be addressed:

- Whether to consider pricing differentials for Principal agencies that have their own back-end applicant tracking system and only use GJT for the portal function.
- Whether to continue offering GJT as an Alliance product.

This memo will provide historical context, a snapshot of the current environment and options going forward.

History of GovJobsToday

GJT was first offered in 2008. As recently as 2014, it was believed that the potential for new customers was promising based on anecdotal feedback from prospective subscribers encountered at professional conferences. The existing users expressed a high level of satisfaction with GJT and onboarding and maintenance required a relatively low level of effort. In 2017, 72.5 development hours were devoted to GJT (out of a total annual development allocation of 3,620 hours).

In 2014 and 2015, projects were completed that provided an updated look and feel for GJT and added new functionality requested by users including forwarding, password changes and inter-jurisdictional collaboration. Since then, small enhancements and bug fixes were completed. A proposed larger project to re-architect the product was planned to provide enhanced features and to port GJT from Microsoft's Webforms platform which will not be supported after 2021. The project was delayed due to resource constraints on the Service Delivery Team and the uncertain future of GJT as the City of Bellevue acquired a private sector HR product (NEOGOV) that includes applicant management among other functions. Bellevue is currently using NEOGOV's applicant management module and NEOGOV's GovernmentJobs portal that lists job opportunities for their customers. Bellevue also posts job openings on and applicants are redirected to NEOGOV.

In 2017, interviews were conducted with Principal agencies representatives. There was strong interest in continuing to support GJT, especially among smaller jurisdictions. As the future of GJT was under discussion, the Executive Board expressed their interest in identifying an alternative solution for current subscribers should the Alliance decide to discontinue GJT. Prior to leaving the Alliance, the previous Executive Director had conducted some research on alternative products.

Current Situation

As of this writing, there are six principals and six subscriber agencies using GJT. Fees that support the cost of maintaining GJT are allocated to cities based on population and, for special purpose districts, a negotiated amount. The 2018 Budget Allocates costs between MyBuildingPermit (MBP) GovJobsToday and NWProperty (NWP) based on direct costs (costs directly related to the support of the product) and remaining Alliance costs based on a percentage recommended by the Executive Director and approved by the Executive Board through the budget process. The 2018 Budget reflects an allocation of 75% to MBP, 12.5% to GJT and 12.5% to NWP. The table below summarizes the relative distribution of the GJT budget to Principal and Subscriber agencies.

Over the past two months, the Alliance has been contacted by three jurisdictions expressing an interest in learning more about GJT and how to subscribe. During that same period, the City of Issaquah notified the Alliance that they are planning to implement NEOGOV and will not be continuing with GovJobsToday after 2018. As a principal agency, Issaquah is not required to use all of the Alliance products (based on the updated and restated Interlocal Agreement). The language in Interlocal Agreement that speaks to the allocation of Alliance costs to principals and subscribers was changed and reads as follows:

Cost Allocation. The costs of funding the approved Alliance budget, net of all estimated revenue chargeable to Subscribers and all other revenues, shall be generally allocated between all Principals based on their relative population. The Board can establish other cost allocation methods by Supermajority Vote that are considered equitable to all other Principals and appropriate for the applicable Programs and Services. Nothing in this Agreement shall be construed to prohibit the Executive Board from including factors in addition to Principal Population or making other equitable adjustments in the cost allocation formulas, including but not limited to adjustments for Principals who do not use or deploy certain Programs and Services offered by the Alliance pursuant to Section 6.g.

No board action relative to specific changes in the cost sharing model has been approved since adoption of the ILA. Further direction is needed from the Executive Board regarding how costs will be allocated between subscribers and principals if principals are not using all or any of the functionality of available products (see discussion below).

Adjustment to Principal Fees

Once the updated and restated ILA was approved allowing Principal agencies to opt out of Alliance products, the previous Executive Director had discussions with Bellevue about a negotiated fee based on partial use of GJT. Bellevue was still interested in using the portal but had moved to NEOGOV's back-end applicant management system. Since GJT fees are based on population, Bellevue believe they were paying a disproportionate share of GJT fees relative to their use of GJT. In the meantime, the City of Issaquah notified the Alliance that they would be implementing NEOGOV and not using GJT after 2018. A draft report was prepared by Ms. Jones but not presented to the Board for consideration.

Loss of Principal or Subscriber fees generally results in a reallocation of fees to other Principals and Subscribers. Much of the Alliance annual expenses are fixed in total but allocated to the Alliance products based on direct hours and other costs related to each product with general

overhead allocated proportionally based on a formula. For example, Service Delivery Team hours are allocated based on actual hours related to MBP, GJT or NWP. The Executive Director’s costs and general costs, such as the audit, are allocated on a percentage distribution. In 2017 and 2018, the ED and general overhead costs were allocated 75% to MBP, 12.5% to GJT and 12.5% to NWP. The 2019-2020 Preliminary Budget recommends shifting costs to MBP with a revised allocation of 90% MPB, 7.5% GJT and 2.5% NWProperty. As mentioned previously, a limited number of hours were allocable to GJT in 2017 and little marketing effort was pursued by the Executive Director.

Fee Distribution Options

GJT fees are derived by establishing the cost of supporting the program (total costs allocated on a percentage basis by the Executive Board during the budget process. Total GJT costs are then distributed to subscribers and principal. Per the adopted financial policies, subscriber fees are set at flat amounts based on ranges of population. The table below shows fees as they are calculated using the current methodology. The previous ED inflated annual fees by an amount for inflation.

Population Range	2017 Fee	2018 Fee	2019 Fee
Less than 6,000	\$ 800	\$ 900	\$ 1,000
6,000 to 8,000	\$1,250	\$1,350	\$1,450
8,000 to 10,000	\$1,500	\$1,600	\$1,700
10,000 to 15,000	\$2,500	\$2,700	\$2,800
15,000 to 25,000	\$3,500	\$3,700	\$3,800
25,000 to 50,000	\$5,000	\$5,300	\$5,400
More than 50,000	\$7,500	\$7,600	\$7,700

Distribution of Fees Between Principals and Subscribers

Principal fees are calculated by taking the total cost of the program, subtracting estimated subscriber fees and distributing the remainder to principals based on population. When a subscriber withdraws, the net amount distributed to principals will increase (notwithstanding any other changes in program cost). When a principal withdraws from GJT, the impact on the remaining principals is greater since the principals must absorb the lost revenue.

The net allocation to principals recognizes the ownership interest they have in Alliance products and the potential for realizing income if an Alliance product (intellectual property) is sold to another agency or private sector interest. The updated and restated ILA does not require principals to use all Alliance products. The ILA does provide for sale or transfer of assets (including intellectual property) with proceeds to the Alliance which is composed of all principals. Principals that choose to change to subscriber status are not entitled to any proceeds from the sale of Alliance property. A principal that chooses not to use an Alliance product does not appear to lose their right to the proceeds related to that product, if it is sold. Issaquah will be the first principal to opt out of a produce without changing to subscriber status. In considering alternative approaches to GJT fees, the relatively higher burden to principals should be considered.

Distribution Factor for Fees – Population versus FTE

The relative distribution between principals and subscribers has shifted costs toward principals. One way to mitigate this burden is to allocate GJT costs to principals and subscribers based on the same distribution factor, whether that is population or another factor such as FTEs. While population has been the historic proxy measure for distribution of GJT costs, the use of FTE's should be considered as it more closely aligns with the potential volume of use of the program (i.e. FTE's relates to the number of potential vacancies and job postings). This is particularly true for jurisdictions that contract for services or are served by a special district such as a fire district. Applying the same FTE factor to all users (principals and subscriber) distributed cost more equitably but may result in "winners and losers."

Allowance for Partial Use of Program

As noted above, the amended and restated Interlocal Agreement allows variable pricing for principals that are not using (or fully using) all of the Alliance products. In the case of GJT, Bellevue is using GJT as a portal to their backend applicant management system (NEOGOV). While they believe there is still value in having the GJT portal, since the fees are based on population, they believe they are paying a disproportionate share of the cost of ongoing support. The City of Issaquah is in a similar situation. They are in the process of implementing NEOGOV and have notified the Alliance that they will not continue to use the GJT Portal. Discussions are ongoing regarding the potential for a new pricing structure and the value of the local portal. Kirkland is in the process of implementing a new enterprise resource management system (finance/HRIS) that has an applicant management module. Although they have not notified the Alliance as to whether or when they will discontinue their use of GJT and at what level. However, their situation is similar to Bellevue and Issaquah. In the case where there is limited or no use of an Alliance product, there could be an offset to account for the limited use. If a jurisdiction chooses not to use a product at all, they can either have no fee or they can be charged a flat "base" fee. The base fee is the cost of keeping the product functional for other users and acknowledges that the principal still has an ownership interest. A base fee may also be applied to all principals and subscribers with the net program cost distributed on usage.

For illustrative purposes, multiple fee scenarios are being developed to simulate the relative impact of these different methodologies on rates that will be presented at the June 15 Executive Board meeting.

Scenario 1 – Maintain population distribution factor with existing subscriber fees (no change)

Scenario 2 – Maintain population distribution factor and subscriber fees with an offset for partial use of the program (75% reduction in population factor based on use of portal only)

Scenario 3 – Change to FTE distribution factor with existing subscriber fees and no offset for partial use

Scenario 4 – Change to FTE Distribution factor with existing subscriber fees and offset for partial use (75% reduction in FTE factor)

Scenario 5 – Change to FTE Distribution to all principals and subscribers (no offset)

Scenario 6 – Change to FTE Distribution to all principals and subscribers with offset for partial use (75% reduction in FTE)

Scenario 7 – Establish flat “base” fee for all principal and subscribers and distribute remaining cost based on FTE with an offset for partial use

For scenario purposes, the base fee was set at 25% of basic maintenance and administration costs and offsets were set at 25% of the distribution factor (population or FTE).

The Future of GovJobs Today

GJT was written in Webforms, a Microsoft product that will not be supported beyond 2021. While Webforms will still be licensed, vendor support from Microsoft will not be available. There are risks with the continued stability of GJT based on an unsupported platform. A strategy for addressing the discontinuation of Webforms support should be developed now with an eye to the future.

There (at least) two alternative paths going forward.

1. Discontinue GovJobsToday within a defined timeline and identify alternative comparable products for current GJT users.
2. Invest in moving GJT to a new platform and pursue marketing of GJT.

Within these alternatives, there are additional policy questions and sub-alternatives to explore including how investments in GJT will be funded. The following sections provide background on each option.

Option One: Discontinue GovJobsToday within a defined timeline and identify alternative comparable products for current GJT users to procure on their own

The Alliance can discontinue the GJT product offering and assist principals and subscribers in transitioning to a new product if needed. Several alternatives were studied:

AWC Job Board

The Association of Washington Cities recently updated their Jobs Available function on their website. They updated the look and feel, added more filtering options and provided a means for applicants to forward their contact information and a resume to prospective employers via email. Their product does not provide applicant management and they do not have plans to add that functionality in the near future. If a jurisdiction listing a job opening at AWC has their own back-end applicant tracking program, the information is transferred from the AWC website via email and the jurisdiction would need to enter the record into their applicant tracking system. AWC charges a fee for posting jobs to their site. The first five jobs are free and every additional job posting can be purchased at \$50 per job or in “packs” – 5-pack for \$200 or 10-pack for \$350.

NEOGOV

NEOGOV offers a suite of Human Resources Information System products including a job board, applicant tracking, background checks, employee onboarding, training and employee

performance management. The cities of Bellevue and Issaquah currently use or are implementing NEOGOV as are a number of other cities and counties in Washington. NEOGOV's customers can choose which modules to purchase and implement. NEOGOV was asked if they would consider a "group price" for their applicant tracking module for current GJT users.

NEOGOVS pricing model is based on employee count (as compared to GJT which used population). FTE counts for each GJT principal and subscriber that did not already use NEOGOV was provided to NEOGOV and they did submit a proposal. Their introductory proposal offers a 30% discount on their subscription fees and a waiver of some up-front costs. The proposal includes implementation assistance and user training, although the training would be conducted in one group session rather than for each individual jurisdiction. NEOGOV is offering the applicant tracking and GovernmentJobs portal subscriptions as well as onboarding (which is optional). The closest match between GJT and NEOGOV would be purchasing Insight product (applicant tracking) and GovernmentJobs subscription (Jobs Board and applicant portal).

A summary of their proposal is shown on the following tables including the proposed cost for NEOGOV compared to current GJT user fees. The first table includes all current GJT users with their current annual fees, excluding Bellevue and Issaquah. It should be noted that the quoted fees are for one year only. The Alliance would need to conduct further negotiation to secure future fees. The second table shows the comparison between GJT and NEOGOV without the 30% introductory discount.

	Employees (Draft)	Current GJT Fees	NEOGOVS Fees w/ 30% Discount	Difference	NEOGOVS Fees w/out 30% Discount	Difference
Bellevue	1,342	24,618	NA	NA	NA	NA
Issaquah	260	6,078	NA	NA	NA	NA
Kenmore	35	3,921	2,682	(1,239)	3,487	(434)
Kirkland	605	15,220	11,664	(3,556)	15,163	(57)
Sammamish	115	9,114	4,798	(4,316)	6,237	(2,877)
Snoqualmie	119	2,343	4,798	2,455	6,237	3,894
	2,476	61,294	23,942	(6,656)	31,125	527
Gig Harbor	107	1,600	3,555	1,955	4,622	3,022
Mercer Island	211	3,600	6,665	3,065	8,665	5,065
NORCOM	89	5,100	3,555	(1,545)	4,622	(479)
Newcastle	29	2,600	2,682	82	3,487	887
Woodinville	38	2,600	2,682	82	3,487	887
	474	15,500	19,139	3,639	24,881	9,381
Total	2,950	76,794	43,081	(3,017)	56,005	9,907

Crelate

Prior to leaving the Alliance, the previous Executive Director, Tracy Jones, conducted research on alternative products and transition options. One of the options considered was a “Transfer/Sell Option” that involved either transferring or selling GJT to a private sector company. Specifically, Ms. Jones had discussed options with Crelate that currently offers on-line job postings for the private sector and that is interested in breaking into the public sector. The Alliance could either transfer GJT to Crelate who would then host the application for up to three years (presumably to the point when the Webforms platform would no longer be supported). A revenue-sharing arrangement could be considered during the three-year transfer period. In the meantime, Crelate would develop a public sector version of their product that they would then market and sell. Crelate was willing to negotiate favorable rates for GJT users during the transition.

Ms. Jones also analyzed the functionality of the Crelate’s existing product against the features of GJT. At that time, there were significant gaps between GJT’s and Crelate’s functionality. An updated “gap analysis” was requested from Crelate that shows the current functionality and describes how Crelate can bridge remaining gaps. Crelate has made significant progress in adding the features and functionality that were missing in the original gap analysis. If the Executive Board is interested in further information about this option, the Executive Director would need to work closely with Crelate about the details of an agreement.

Option Two: Invest in moving GJT to a new platform and pursue marketing of product

GovJobsToday is a viable product that has not been actively marketed over the past few years. Requests for new subscriptions had been put on hold given the uncertain future of the product. The Bellevue Service Delivery Team was asked to provide an estimate of developer hours needed to rearchitect GJT on a new platform. The initial estimate assumed the equivalent of three developers for two years and Project Manager/Business Analyst hours.

The table below shows the estimated cost.

	Hours	Hourly Rate	Estimated Cost
Application Developer	9,960	\$ 111	\$ 1,105,560
Project Manager/Business Analyst	3,320	\$ 90	\$ 298,800
Total	13,280		\$ 1,404,360

If Bellevue were to provide developer and project manager hours to move GJT to a new platform, it would require a significant investment. Since there are comparable private sector products (notably NEOGOV), it is hard to make a business case for this investment unless the Alliance can identify specific functionality that cannot or would not otherwise be provided by private sector offerings or request a quote from a private sector developer.

Conclusion

At this time, it appears that the trend is for larger jurisdictions to transition to NEOGOV or another back-end applicant management program. That leaves smaller jurisdictions that may not need all of the functionality of NEOGOV. Depending on how the Executive Board changes GJT rates for 2019-2020, NEOGOV pricing may or may not be more affordable. While decision about the future of GJT is not necessary at this time, staff is requesting direction about which options to continue to pursue. GJT fees for 2019-2020 do need to be established to stay within the September 15 notification deadline, unless the Board chooses to schedule an additional meeting before then to finalize rates.

Comparison of Functionality: GovJobsToday & Crelate

This is a gap comparison of functionality between GovJobsToday and Crelate and identifies what functionality may be added to Crelate to enable GovJobsToday clients to retain and exceed their current level of service in the event that the Alliance Board transitions ownership of GovJobsToday to Crelate.

Please note that this document is not an agreement and does not guarantee the addition of features by Crelate unless negotiated as part of the transition agreement. In the event that there is an agreement between GovJobsToday and Crelate, then Crelate would help set-up basic configurations so that current GovJobsToday customers could more easily transition to the new tool. These basic configurations will need to be identified and settled as part of the larger agreement.

Document Overview

- Gap analysis of applicant functionality
- Gap analysis of employer (admin) functionality
- Crelate features/functionality not available in GovJobsToday
- Recommended next steps

Gap Analysis of Applicant Functionality

Table 1: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Applicant Functionality		
GovJobsToday Applicant Functionality	Specificity	Comparison to Crelate
Search/Home Page	Locational (cities in area), Job Type, and Job Category	<p>Each employer (jurisdiction) will have their own database and product access within Crelate.</p> <p>Each employer would also have their own job page via an API embedded into their website. Color and formatting options available.</p> <p>Possible Addition: Crelate is able to add a shared job board with similar groupings for Employer, Job Type, and Job Category. Crelate would add a connect feature to a shared job board based on geographic location.</p>

Table 1: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Applicant Functionality

GovJobsToday Applicant Functionality	Specificity	Comparison to Crelate
Create Account	User Name and Password	<p>Crelate does not currently require a login to apply for jobs, as any barriers to applying will reduce the number of applicants. Crelate supports Auto-Apply from Indeed and Zip Recruiter (swipe of finger to apply).</p> <p>Possible Addition: Crelate is able to add a login functionality, however this would mean that Auto-Apply functionality would not work.</p>
	Assigned System Generated Applicant ID	<p>Possible Addition: Crelate is able to generate an Applicant ID. Currently system generates emails letting the applicant know if recruiter is interested. Emails are configurable at each step of the workflow. Crelate also has an auto-reply option that is customizable and will be send from the user's email address after an applicant applies.</p>
User Profile		
Contact Info	Name & Address Phone & Email Additional Info Valid Driver's License - Yes/No Commercial Driver's License - Yes/No Enter Professional Licenses, Certs, Reg Are you authorized to work in the US	<p>Generally, Yes - When applicant applies from job board page, then applicant enters name, basic contact information, and attaches resume. The system parses last job and basic information from the resume into an easy to read table for recruiter to read.</p> <p>Crelate observation – GovJobsToday questions asking about driver's license and commercial license could be asked in a questionnaire if applicable to the job posted. Each job has a customizable application form that can be added with yes/no questions and will directly be affiliated in searchable tags.</p>
Education	Able to Add <i>School Name, Location, Education Type, Degree, Graduated (Yes/No), Year Graduated, Major</i>	<p>Possible Addition: The job application process does not currently include Education section, as it is part of the resume. Crelate is able to create a Long-Apply format, however this would mean that Auto-Apply functionality would not work. For candidates with resumes, Crelate makes viewing resumes very easy, so education and work history are viable via a PDF right in the browser.</p>

Table 1: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Applicant Functionality

GovJobsToday Applicant Functionality	Specificity	Comparison to Crelate
Work History	Able to Add Job Title, Position Type, Position Status, Employer, Location, Dates Worked, Final Salary, Duties, Reason for Leaving, Supervisor Info,	Possible Addition: The job application process does not currently include Work History section, as is part of the resume. Crelate is able to create a Long-Apply format, however this would mean that Auto-Apply functionality would not work.
Dashboard	Job's I've Applied For Job Applications in Draft View Historical	Possible Addition: Crelate is able to add an applicant dashboard to track Job's Applied For and Jobs in Draft. The applicant ID would be useful if there was an applicant dashboard to track jobs applied for and jobs in draft.
Change Password		Possible Addition: Crelate is able to add as part of login/password functionality. Crelate would also look to allow applicants to login via Facebook, LinkedIn, etc.
Apply Now	User Profile Contact Infor Education Work History Personal Info Resume Job Questions Review Finish & Submit	Current application process for Crelate jobs is now: Name Contact Information Resume Job Questions Additional process steps can be added to application process, but generally more steps/barriers reduce the number of applicants.
Applicant Status	View Individual Applicant Status View Overall Status	Yes I believe this functionality is fully available out of the box.

Gap Analysis of Employer (Admin) Functionality

The tables below compare Jurisdiction and Applicant functionality.

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality		
GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
Create user types and permission levels	<u>Minimum needed:</u> Read Contribute Full Control Jurisdiction Admin	Ability to create user types and control access. Similar categories could be created. In general within Crelate, the user types apply to all jobs for the organization. However, the HR person can create a Hiring Manager role. The Hiring Manager role only has review and comment permission on specific jobs. Crelate is looking to improve the Hiring Manager role in the future. Crelate also has full custom role capability, allowing Administrators to create a 'user role' for each group of users. User roles allow you to control read, edit, delete and other privileges on core records, various system functions such as data Export, API access, and much more.
Unique Job Identifier	System generates unique ID	Crelate jobs have a unique email identifier (email address). Can also turn-on auto-numbering of jobs. In Crelate when an applicant sends a resume to the unique-job email the system parses out the address, the name, last job. The unique-job email can be turned off.
File Types	Apply using PDF	Apply using PDF, txt, rdf, doc, docx
Job Dashboards		

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
Draft Jobs	<p><u>Columns:</u> Job Title Date Opened Date Closing Access (grant contribute and read only access to other users)</p> <p>Ability to Open and Edit Jobs by Job Title</p>	<p>Crelate has a “Sales” workflow that can be configured to include the entire job hiring process – requisition, job draft, job posted, job closed. Each grouping is essentially a dashboard. Columns can easily be added/removed from the dashboard (grouping).</p> <p>The Sales workflow can be easily repurposed to manage the life cycle of the opening of a new position, the posting can go through various internal stages before being published or made available for recruiting.</p>
Current Jobs (Posted)	<p><u>Columns:</u> Job Number Job Title Date Opened Date Closing Time to Fill Number of Applicants Access (grant contribute and read only access to other users)</p> <p>Ability to Open and Edit Jobs by Job Title Ability to View Applicant List</p>	<p>Crelate has a “Sales” workflow that can be configured to include the entire job hiring process – requisition, job draft, job posted, job closed. Each grouping is essentially a dashboard. Columns can easily be added/removed from the dashboard (grouping).</p> <p>The Sales workflow can be easily repurposed to manage the life cycle of the opening of a new position, the posting can go through various internal stages before being published or made available for recruiting.</p> <p>All of the columns (Except “Access”) noted on the left are currently supported.</p>

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
Active (In Review)	<p><u>Columns:</u> Job Number Job Title Date Opened Date Closing Time to Fill Number of Applicants Access (grant contribute and read only access to other users) Complete (select to archive)</p> <p>Ability to Open and Edit Jobs by Job Title Ability to View Applicant List</p>	<p>Crelate has a “Sales” workflow that can be configured to include the entire job hiring process – requisition, job draft, job posted, job closed. Each grouping is essentially a dashboard. Columns can easily be added/removed from the dashboard (grouping).</p> <p>Regarding functionality to grant access to others, in Crelate the Employer Admin can add Hiring Managers to specific jobs with limited role of read and comment only.</p> <p>Able to easily access the Applicant page which shows all applicants broken out into individual dashboard based on status in the hiring process – pre-screen, test, interview, finalist, etc. The applicant breakouts are configurable by Employer.</p>
Job History/Archive	<p><u>Columns:</u> Job Number Job Title Date Opened Date Closing Time to Fill Number of Applicants Access (grant contribute and read only access to other users) Ability to View Applicant List</p>	<p>Crelate has a “Sales” workflow that can be configured to include the entire job hiring process – requisition, job draft, job posted, job closed. Each grouping is essentially a dashboard. Columns can easily be added/removed from the dashboard (grouping).</p> <p>Specifically, to view job history, the Employer would filter on Closed or Open jobs. Can also perform basic and advanced searches on All Jobs.</p> <p>All of the columns (Except “Access”) noted on the left are currently supported.</p>

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
	Deleted Archived Jobs <i>Ability to delete jobs once outside the legal retention period</i>	Crelate can restrict job deletion to Employer Admin. The deletion of jobs would be Policy driven. Crelate does not set retention perimeters or prevent deletion of documents within/outside policy retention period. Important for consideration of Employer solutions to manage. Crelate can now prevent the deletion of jobs, contacts, and companies by non-administrative users. Each individual user can have their own role set to give control over which users have certain levels of access. Crelate also offers an audit log to track user activity. Note: this could be added to the Crelate roadmap in the future
	Sort Archive Jobs by Year	Yes – Employer adds columns to tables and sort by any column added.
Job Application Tracking		
Applicant Dashboard	Show applicants by the Hiring Process Columns: ID (system generated Applicant ID) Applicant Name (links to individual application) Min Qual *Each phase of hiring process Add Comment to Individual Applicant	Yes – Employer is able to move applicants through the hiring process by drag/dropping them into different groupings (or using menus). Each grouping in the workflow is essentially a dashboard and can be viewed in either table/column layout or tile layout. There is also an aggregate views that lets you see, report and manage all candidates across all jobs. Drag/drop functionality used to move applicants from one grouping to another grouping, essentially moving them through the application review process. In this scenario the Employer would create the end-to-end hiring process (pre-screen, test, phone interview, in-person interview). If a specific job did not use all steps, then skip step.

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
	Change Applicant Status (per phase of hiring process): Proceed (Y) Do Not Proceed (N) Not Determined (N/S) Withdrawal (W) If/Then Logic applied – If Applicant “Does Not Proceed” then Applicant has ‘N’ for all remaining fields	Instead of marking applicants with a Y, N, N/S, or W, Crelate allows Employer to drag/drop applicants into status groupings. Crelate uses a workflow stage approach. Essentially same functionality but more intuitive and enables easy emails or next steps to be applied to entire groupings (for instance all applicants that made it to the interview phase).
	<u>Select View:</u> All Applicants Qualified Applicants Disqualified Applicants	Easy to view applicants by grouping. Groupings can include Disqualified and those Qualified by various grouping (stage of application process). Colors can be applied based on data (ex: fade out candidates that haven’t had activity)
	Apply Questionnaire Filters	Yes – Able to create questionnaires and add columns to applicant table to filter on specific questions. Possible Addition: Crelate has questionnaires, but is looking to expand functionality and would use GovJobsToday questionnaires types to make options more robust.
	Export List	Yes – Able to export any table and notes. Tables columns can be added by Employer to make export more useful.
	Add Applicant <i>Takes Admin through Application process. Can be used if a person applies in-person or is not able to apply</i>	Yes – Able to manually add applicant and upload documents to an applicant’s application. This may be important if a test was taken and needs to be uploaded. The system can also take resumes sent to the unique-job email and parse elements of resume into application.

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
	Forward Selected Applicants by Email	<p>Yes – Able to email applicant list and full application packages (PDF only)</p> <p>Possible Addition: Crelate to verify that questionnaires and additional long-form application would also be packaged.</p> <p>Possible Addition: Crelate is planning to add magic link which will allow the Employer Admin to send Hiring Manager a link to the applicants instead of emailing application packages. The link would be set to expire after specified length of time. Also reduced burden of having to create “Hiring Manager” in the system and granting access.</p>
	Print Selected Applications	Yes
	Email Selected Applicants	Yes
	Email Selected Applicants using a Template	Yes
Individual Applicant	<p><u>Click on Applicant Name to View Individual Application:</u> Applicant Information Questions Work History Education History</p>	Opening an application from a candidate list or job dashboard shows full candidate detail, all activity about the candidate, and provides access to view the resume, other attached documents, questionnaires and work history + education (if filled out by the recruiter). Currently, Crelate does not “parse” work history (beyond current employer and title) or education, instead it leaves it in the resume for viewing.
	Open/Print PDF Application	Yes
	Open/Print Word Application	<p>The ability to open documents directly in Microsoft Word from the web browser is now in beta and will be released later this summer.</p>
	Email PDF Application to someone	Yes
	Add a Note/Comment to Applicant File	Yes
	Edit Note/Comment on Applicant File	Yes – ability to add multiple notes, link applicant to an internal referral, and ability to broadcast note to other reviewers if it is important

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
	View Application as one (1) long web page	No, however when an applicant is selected the applicant profile appears in the right-side panel and Employer can access information and attachments easily
	Ability to Add Attachments	<p>The Employer can currently add attachments to an applicant profile.</p> <p>Possible Addition: Crelate is planning to enhance the attachment feature to enable multiple attachments and document types.</p> <p>Crelate has the capability to add multiple document types to an application. Administrators can configure their own “Document Types” for better categorization and for use in internal templates.</p>
Create/Edit Jobs	<i>Below are a list of fields used by GovJobsToday</i>	
	Job Number (system generated number)	Yes – Crelate can generate a unique email address for the job OR a unique job number.
	Job Title	Yes
	Job Code (internal code)	Yes – This can be created using a custom field. The Employer can add custom fields and then add fields as columns to any table.
	<u>Employment Type</u> (or ability to add/edit): Full Time Part Time On Call Internship Project Term Seasonal Temporary Variable	Yes – The choices available are configurable by Employer. Possible Addition: If transition occurs between GovJobsToday and Crelate, then Crelate could set up similar base configurations those comfortable with GovJobsToday.

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
	<u>Job Type</u> (or ability to add/edit): 1040 FTE LTE Project Term Seasonal Temporary Variable	Yes – The choices available are configurable by Employer. Possible Addition: If transition occurs between GovJobsToday and Crelate, then Crelate could set up similar base configurations those comfortable with GovJobsToday.

	<u>Job Categories</u> or ability to add/edit): Accounting & Finance Administrative & Executive Support Aquatics Attorney & Legal Assistance Building Inspection & Code Enforcement Clerical & Data Entry Communications & Media Corrections Court Administration Custodial Dispatch Economic Development Engineering Environmental Services Facilities Fire & Paramedic Fleet Services General & Skilled Labor Human Resources Human Services Information Technology Internship Library Other - Miscellaneous Parks & Recreation Planning & Community Development Police & Law Enforcement Records Management & City Clerk Risk Management & Safety Sanitation & Waste Management Senior & Executive Management Transit & Drivers Transportation Water & Waste Water Utilities Maintenance	Yes – The choices available are configurable by Employer. Possible Addition: If transition occurs between GovJobsToday and Crelate, then Crelate could set up similar base configurations those comfortable with GovJobsToday.
	<u>EEOC Categories</u> (or ability to add/edit): Administrative Support	Yes – Crelate has already added the EEO-1 categories.

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
	Officials and Administrators Paraprofessionals Professionals Protective Service Workers Service-Maintenance Skilled Craft Workers Technicians	Possible Addition: If transition occurs between GovJobsToday and Crelate, then Crelate can add the EEO-4 and EEO-5 categories.
	<u>Job Status:</u> Posted Closed Completed	Yes – The choices available are configurable by Employer.
	Location <i>Ability to add multiple location names and addresses</i>	Yes – Crelate captures location information but does not have multiple location options Possible Addition: Crelate has locations, but is looking to expand this functionality so that the Employer can select the ‘location’ from a list of locations (addresses) when creating a Job Posting.
	Department <i>Ability to add multiple department names</i>	No Possible Addition: Crelate is looking to expand this functionality so that the Employer can select the ‘department’ from a list of departments when creating a Job Posting. We are considering a feature that we are calling “Database Segmentation” that might address this request specifically.
	Contribute Users <i>Ability to add Contribute Users by direct link to system or by entering email</i>	Yes – Crelate has security roles that the Employers can use that provides ‘Contribute’ level access
	Read Users <i>Ability to add Read Users by direct link to system or by entering email</i>	Yes – Crelate has a ‘Hiring Manager’ role that allows Read and Comment. Possible Addition: Crelate can add a role to only allow ‘Read’ to if needed.
	Requisition Date	Yes – the field can be added with a custom field and manually updated

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
	Job Open Date	Yes
	Job Open Time	No
	Job Close Date	Yes
	Job Close Time	No
	Option – Open Until Filled	Yes
	First Review Date	Yes – the field can be added with a custom field and manually updated
	Job Offer Date	Yes – the field can be added with a custom field and manually updated
	Job Hire Date	Yes – the field can be added with a custom field and manually updated
	<u>Salary Minimum:</u> Hourly Weekly Monthly Yearly	Currently provides annual salary ranges only. Possible Addition: Crelate is able to expand the choices for this field.
	<u>Salary Maximum:</u> Hourly Weekly Monthly Yearly	Currently provides annual salary ranges only. Possible Addition: Crelate is able to expand the choices for this field.
	Job Description (free text field with edit ability)	Yes – the text limit for this field is large The field is an HTML field and the limit is very large (I believe the cap is ~25k character)
	Ability to add additional free text fields, including: Principle Accountabilities, Minimum Qualifications, Position Details, Work Conditions, Union Affiliations, Selection Process	There are not separate sections in Crelate. The Employer would use the Job Description field and use HTML Edit feature to add Header and Bullets with formatting. Possible Addition: Sections for better formatting / standardization

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
	Create Questionnaire	<p>Yes</p> <p>Possible Addition: Crelate has questionnaires, but is looking to expand functionality and would use GovJobsToday questionnaires types to make options more robust.</p> <p>We have already started development on the next version of our questionnaires, to include multiple choice options and more. We hope to release this by end of Summer 2018.</p>
	Alternate Apply URL <i>Sometimes needed for Protective Service Jobs</i>	Possible Addition: Crelate can add this functionality.
	<u>Job Application Steps:</u> <i>Ability to select if Required, Optional, Excluded</i> Work History Education History Resume Cover Letter	Possible Addition: Crelate can create job application steps for Long-Apply process, but the Auto-Apply functionality would not work.
	Post as internal recruitment - Yes/No <i>If Yes, location for internal URL or way to hide internal posting from general public</i>	Possible Addition: Crelate can create an Internal Only button so that the Job is not posted to the public job board.
	Ability to create/add skill groups	Yes
	Hiring Process <i>Ability to order hiring process for each job</i>	Yes – The Employer can create one hiring process with all possible steps and then skip steps if they do not apply to a specific Job recruitment.
	Save Job	Yes for future editing
	Preview Job	Yes
	Clone Job	Yes
	Cancel Job (exit without saving)	Yes
Set-Up & Change Organizational Settings	<i>The settings that apply to all jobs or that can be edited per job</i>	

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
General Information	<u>General Info Set-Up:</u> Org Name, URL, Contact Email Org Logo Include Job in Portal – Yes/No Display Link to Portal Allow Notes in Applicant Review for Full Control User Require Applicant Screening by Full Control User Applicant view self status or full list Thank You Message Applicant Release Form/Text Page Footer	Most of these organizational setting features are available. Possible Addition: Crelate is able to add an applicant dashboard to track Job’s Applied For and Jobs in Draft. The control of offering dashboard would be turned off/on within settings.
Application Process	Add steps to hiring process	The Employer can create one hiring process with all possible steps and then skip steps if they do not apply to a specific Job recruitment.
	Delete steps from hiring process	The Employer can create one hiring process with all possible steps and then skip steps if they do not apply to a specific Job recruitment.
	Re-order steps to hiring process	The Employer can create one hiring process with all possible steps and then skip steps if they do not apply to a specific Job recruitment.
Skill Types	Add, Delete, Edit the Skill Type and Description	Yes – the field can be added with a custom field
	Require Resume and Cover Letter (default setting)	Yes – currently require Resume. Possible Addition: Crelate is planning to enhance to include multiple applicant attachments. Yes, a cover letter can be designated as a required document in the application form.
Location	Add, Delete, Edit name of location and location address. Allow multiple for different work locations	Yes – Crelate captures location information but does not have multiple location options Possible Addition: Crelate has locations, but is looking to expand this functionality so that the Employer can add multiple ‘locations’. The Employer would be able to select one location when posting a job.

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
Departments	Add, Delete, Edit Departments or Work Groups	No Possible Addition: Crelate is looking to add functionality so that the Employer can add multiple 'departments'. The Employer would be able to select one department when posting a job.
Questionnaires	Create, Delete, Modify predefined questionnaires that can be added to individual Job postings	Yes Possible Addition: Crelate has questionnaires, but is looking to expand functionality and would use GovJobsToday questionnaires types to make options more robust. We have already started development on the next version of our questionnaires, to include multiple choice options and more. We hope to release this by end of Summer 2018.
	Share questionnaires with other organizations (Cities)	No
Email Templates	Create, Delete, Modify email templates	Yes
	Share email templates with other organizations (Cities)	No
Lock Pages	Lock pages for editing, to prevent multiple editors at one time	N/A – this functionality is not needed because Crelate has discrete operations per field. In the unlikely event that two people are editing the same field at the same time, the system would save edits saved last.
	Unlock after a specified length of time (15 minutes)	Not applicable, see above comment.
	Ability for Jurisdiction Admin to unlock pages	Not applicable, see above comment.
Reports		
EEO Reports	Single Job Statistics Detail	YES – This functionality is now available as of Q1 2018.
	Single Job Statistics Summary	Yes
	Summary of All Jobs	Yes
	Summary Hired Applicants	Yes
	Summary by EEO Category	Yes

Table 2: Gap Analysis for GovJobsToday Employer Functionality

GovJobsToday Employer Functionality	Specificity	Does Crelate Have Functionality?
Performance	Length to Hire	<p>Yes</p> <p>Length to hire, time in stage and fallout reporting existing now as overall averages.</p>
Misc	Deleted Jobs	<p>This would be in the audit history; audit longs currently only stay around for 90 days.</p>
Other General		
	Search Jobs Using Keywords <i>Select to search by Job Title or Description</i>	Yes – Crelate has simple and advanced search capabilities. Crelate’s search enable searching the full text of all documents, notes, activities and fields all at once.
	Search Applicants	Yes – Crelate has simple and advanced search capabilities. Crelate’s search enable searching the full text of all documents, notes, activities and fields all at once.
	Add Users and Assign Role	Yes
	Delete Users	Yes

Crelate Features/Functionality Not Provided By GovJobsToday

Below is a listing of additional Crelate functionality that is not offered by GovJobsToday. Because Crelate is a new product and undergoing constant development, new features/functionality will continue to be added.

- Job Posting/Amplification – Job are automatically posted on several mainstream job boards to increase job visibility, including: Indeed, Glassdoor, CareerBuilder, ZipRecruiter, SimplyHired, JobInventory, and others. The Employer also has the ability to sponsor specific jobs by paying for additional visibility on the external job sites.
- Email and Calendar Integration – Crelate integrates with Office 365 and Gmail for easy calendar control and tracking.
- Auto Apply Feature – Auto apply is becoming more in demand and can increase applicant pools. Applicants using Indeed and Zip Recruiter can apply with a swipe of the finger.
- ERP Integration – Crelate can be integrate with Employer ERP with an API and custom development
- Drag/Drop functionality – It is easy to move applicants through the hiring process with drag and drop. You can easily see the applicants that have not been reviewed and those in various phases of the hiring process. Crelate provides both table (rows of data) and tiles, so that the Employer can select the visual layout of information that appeals the most.
- Customizable Fields – The Employer can add customizable fields and choices within a field.
- Customizable Tables – The Employer can add columns to tables, including applicant tables for each individual job posting, to make the review process easier. For instance, if you have a Question that is critical to determine if a candidate is qualified, you can add that Question to the table as a column. Employer also has the ability to sort any column and to export any table created.
- Robust Comment Functionality – The Employer can make multiple comments and can broadcast comments to other reviewers if there is something important.
- Three Panel Screen View – Three columns allow the Employer to quickly find and review data. Click on an applicant name and the full resume appears on the right for review. Single page experience, keeps the panels open as you change from one candidate to the next.
- Unique Job Email – Unique Job email address is created for each job and when an applicant sends their resume to address it automatically parses out key information.
- Resume Parsing – Crelate parses out important information from the applicant resume, such as name, last position, last employer. If a resume has unique formatting and does not automatically parse information, then the Employer can view and add info to the table as needed.

- Robust Search Functionality – Crelate has a lot more search functionality
- GIS/Mapping – Crelate provides a map of applicant addresses so that the Employer can see how far away applicants are, which may be important for certain jobs.
- Robust Application Types – Crelate accept resumes/applications via PDF, RFD, Doc, Docx, and TXT.
- Mobile Client – Access jobs and candidates from Android or Iphone Devices
- iPad Client – Access the full application from an iPad
- Outlook Client – View candidate activity and more from within Microsoft Outlook
- Advanced Reports – Robust reporting; with improvements coming in Q4 2017.
- Automatic Email tracking – If connected to your email server; all correspondents can be tracked (Note; additional fees may apply)
- Text Messaging ((Currently in Beta with an anticipated full launch this summer) – Send and receive text messages with candidates (additional fees apply)
- Du-duplication and Merge functionality
- Tagging – Custom tags and tag groups to help organize and categories candidates

Recommended Next Steps

- Provide gap analysis and demo to GovJobsToday power users to get their feedback.
- Discuss transition details including introduction of additional features that GovJobsToday users are accustomed to, baseline configurations, transition timeline, change management/support for users, and any financial agreements.
- Present final recommendation to the Board.

OTHER QUESTIONS>>>>>

Who is the vendor for AWC?

Are jurisdictions ok without controlled retention period?

Is the site 508 compliant – for visually impaired..(primarily concerned with application site)? ALE: We need to research this, but we would like to support this.

How would Alliance help with transition/ Change Management?